

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission  
Architectural Review Committee  
Meeting Minutes

Date: January 17, 2017

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 8<sup>th</sup> Floor Homeland Security Conference Room, New Orleans, Louisiana.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Adjourned: 4:35 p.m.

Members present: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Members absent: Wayne Troyer

## **I. AGENDA**

1. Approval of the minutes of the December 20, 2016 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Elliott Perkins

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliot Perkins, Beth Jacob, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 501 Elysian Fields Avenue

Application: Francisco Alecha, applicant; 501 Efa Hotel LLC, owner; Partial demolition of two (2) existing warehouse and new construction of 75,000 SF four-story hotel.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to defer a recommendation for conceptual approval. The ARC agreed that the retention of the historic warehouses in the proposal is a much more viable proposal. In moving forward, the ARC suggested addressing first the form and mass and then the composition and materiality.

With regard to the form and mass, the ARC recommended braking up the mass at the downriver side of the historic warehouses (intersection of Decatur Street and Marigny Street). They recommend retaining the first two (2) floors to establish the warehouse mass at the street edge and shifting the third and fourth floor back approximately 12'-0".

In regards to the composition and materiality, the ARC agreed that the windows as drawn are successful in reducing the scale of the building and are a substantial improvement in relating to the context. They recommended modifying them to be either square or increasing the height to be more rectangular and to set the windows in to create recesses. They also recommended removing the faux windows at the Chartres Street elevation (closest to Elysian Fields) and replacing them with recesses. The ARC agreed that the entry still seems awkward. The amalgam of formal moves appear individual and unrelated as they are not supported by the rest of the elevation. The entrance needs to be more unified and requires additional elements to bring the entrance together. The ARC agreed that the windows at the entry were generic and should be developed further. The ARC has requested ground level perspectives at the corners of the proposal per the attached sketch.

Second: Beth Jacob  
Result: Passed  
In Favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins  
Opposed:  
Comments:

3. 1125 N. Tonti Street

Application: Loretta Katherine Harmon, applicant; Odyssey House Louisiana Inc, owner; Installation of 10' x 50' temporary (2 years) office trailer in rear parking lot of Odyssey House (Landmark).

Motion: Elliott Perkins recommended conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level.

Second: Beth Jacob  
Result: Passed  
In Favor: Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins, John Klingman  
Opposed:  
Comments:

4. 3209 Chartres Street

Application: Robert Pell, applicant; Jason R White, owner; Construct new three-story, 2,375 SF addition to existing one-story residential building.

Motion: The ARC recommended that the windows on the first floor should match the windows used on the rest of the addition and the divided "factory" windows should only be used at the second floor, as it has its own distinct treatment. They were concerned about the profiles of the selected window unit and suggested using accurate dimensions from the manufacturer to draw enlarged partial elevations of the windows and to ensure that the muntins are not too thick. They also recommended drawing the windows in context with the metal panels at a larger scale, as both elements have their own patterns and should be designed so that these modules work with one another. John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the details, with the final details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Second: Beth Jacob  
Result: Passed  
In Favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins  
Opposed:  
Comments:

5. 2721 Decatur Street

Application: Megan Bell, applicant; owner; Demolish existing one-story accessory building and construct new two-story residential building.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the details with remaining details to be worked out at Staff level. The ARC questioned the necessity of the skylights on the historic building. If they are to remain, the ARC recommended reducing the overall dimensions to minimize visibility from the public right of way. The ARC also recommended investigating the original condition of the shuttered opening on the street facing elevation. If evidence suggests it was a window, the ARC recommends reinstalling an HDLC approved window. If the evidence suggests it was a simple shuttered opening, make an appointment with me to discuss an appropriate option, but the fixed glass was not an approvable solution.

Second: Beth Jacob  
Result: Passed  
In Favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins  
Opposed:  
Comments:

6. 715-717 Second Street

Application: Patrick Anderson, applicant; 717 Second Street LLC, owner; Construct camelback addition on existing one-story residential building.

Motion John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. Windows at the front of the camelback addition should be raised, and the sill height of the windows at the rear brought up to 36". Larger windows at the side elevation would be preferred, all window header heights should be the same at each floor level. Door and transom proportions should be studied. There should only be one light fixture at the secondary entrance.

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

7. 627 Gordon Street

Application: Clifton James, applicant; Elite Renovations Trust, owner; New construction of one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to defer this application for additional review. The ARC recommended modifying the roof at the front elevation to encompass the bay window. Typically bay windows are within the limits of the building roof. The ARC recommended removing the roof triangles. Following desk review, Staff recommends the following revisions: front brick foundation wall to be stucco finished, shift the face of the side bump out back to allow for the 18'-0" parking requirement, changed the poured concrete driveway to two (2) drive strips, extend the stucco covered brick foundation wall to approximately 10'-0" past the 7'-0" high opaque fence. Raise the header heights to approximately 9'-6". Add additional windows to the side elevations.

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

8. 2266 St. Claude Avenue

Application: Bastion Developments LLC, applicant/owner; Modify storefront at existing commercial building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the collection of elements tends to make the elevation appear schizophrenic. They recommend maintaining the sill heights at the fixed glass at the front elevation and to incorporate full length doors at either end. The doors should be 3'-0" ADA solid wood doors with full length glass panes. The ARC also suggested incorporating an operable wood sidelight to address the width requirements of the program. This modification should additionally allow the new storefront to align with the 'bays' of the existing transom windows. The ARC also agreed that the proposed quoins should be removed at the first level, but those existing at the second level should be retained.

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In Favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

9. 3000 Royal Street

Application: Gary Krasnow, applicant; Union Brew Pub LLC, owner; First floor renovation of two-story commercial building, including modifications to window and door openings.

Motion: The ARC felt that the proposed design should be modified to better work with the existing building fabric, rather than adjusting the building to meet the needs of the interior program. Openings should be retained where possible and any new openings should be composed to relate better to the existing building and the overall design intent. Side-by-side elevations of the existing and proposed conditions would help to better understand all of the changes that are being made. There is more flexibility on the Royal Street side of the building than the Montegut Street side. The ARC also suggested that the height of the new glass overhead doors should be increased. Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer this application for additional review.

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

10. 2124 Laurel Street

Application: 4318 Bienville LLC, applicant/owner; New Construction of single family residential building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The current design is not contextual, and needs further study. The side elevations are under fenestrated, the openings should be larger and more consistent. The cantilevered balcony has an overbearing quality so close to the sidewalk and should be grounded to the porch with either columns or wall structure. The ARC expressed concern that the hardi panel established a strong a-contextual visual rhythm. Should this be pursued, a detail of the hardi panels and flashing should be submitted.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

11. 746 Washington Avenue

Application: Nadir N Hamdan, applicant/owner; Renovation and addition of second floor to mixed use building.

Motion: The ARC voted to defer this application for additional review. The proposed addition is not appropriate, and does not meet IBC building code standards.

Seconded: Elliott Perkins

Result: John Klingman

In favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

12. 1502 Governor Nicholls Street

Application: Brian Gille, applicant; Orca Dream Home Developers LLC, owner; New construction of two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Beth Jacob made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the proposal feels low and wide despite the height. The ARC recommended increasing the header heights at the first floor. At the front entry, the door height should be increased to address the header height increase. They also recommended changing the windows at the second level to evenly divided windows (6/6 vs 6/9), and to change the roof pitch to 7:12. The ARC recommended incorporating a wood apron and apron drip cap to demarcate the interior floor on the exterior, reducing the overhangs on the sides and to ensure the 18'-0" parking requirement has been met.

Seconded: John Klingman  
Result: Passed  
In favor: Wayne Troyer, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins  
Opposed:  
Comments:

13. 1506 Governor Nicholls Street

Application: Brian Gille, applicant; Orca Dream Home Developers LLC, owner; New construction of two-story, single-family residential building.  
Motion: Beth Jacob made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the proposal feels low and wide despite the height. The ARC recommended increasing the header heights at the first floor. At the front entry, the door height should be increased to address the header height increase. They also recommended changing the windows at the second level to evenly divided windows (6/6 vs 6/9), and to change the roof pitch to 7:12. The ARC recommended incorporating a wood apron and apron drip cap to demarcate the interior floor on the exterior, reducing the overhangs on the sides and to ensure the 18'-0" parking requirement has been met.  
Seconded: John Klingman  
Result: Passed  
In favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins  
Opposed:  
Comments:

14. 604 Seventh Street

Application: Kristen Klammer, applicant; Manon B Mashburn, owner; New construction of a two-story, single-family residential building.  
Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the depth of the balcony should be at least 10" at the front elevation. The horizontal slats of the railing should sit on the outside of the vertical posts and meet the soffit below in such a manner that this element reads as an intersecting volume.  
Seconded: Elliott Perkins  
Result: Passed  
In favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins  
Opposed:  
Comments:

15. 6011 Dauphine Street

Application: Kim Finney, applicant; Edward L Booker, owner; New construction of a one-story, single-family residential building.  
Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC recommended changing the pile foundation to piers (or another system other than piles). They recommended adding a window to the side elevation to the right of the side door. They agreed that the windows seem large at the front elevation and the sills appear low. They recommend reducing the window size. They agreed that the front overhang is too deep and recommended bringing the roof forward over the porch. They also recommended adding an additional foundation vent centered on the bay.  
Seconded: Beth Jacob  
Result: Passed  
In Favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins,  
Opposed:  
Comments

15. 708 Washington Avenue

Application: Rachel Hall Taravella, applicant; John R Patton, owner; Renovate existing single-family residential building and camelback addition.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that Option 3 would be the most appropriate, and would like to review any changes to the existing fenestration. The camelback addition should be setback two rooms from the front wall of the building. All elements at the front elevation should be repaired/replaced to match existing.

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

16. 2847 Livaudais Street

Application: Joel Ross, applicant; Propertyllc Dtr, owner; Renovate existing warehouse building into brewery, construct new canopy over Sixth Street courtyard.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the ARC level. The structure of the canopy should be integrated in the design since it will be highly visible. The ARC agreed that the visual lightness of the canopy is critical to its success and as such the engineering must not compromise it.

Seconded: Elliott Perkins

In favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

Opposed:

Comments:

17. 735 Flood Street

Application: Ice Station Zebra Associates LLC, owner; New construction of one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the following recommendations:

- The proposed foundation should be built such that the pilings are not visible and should appear to be masonry piers.
- Create higher transoms by raising the header heights to 8'-6" for transoms and windows to be consistent throughout.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

In favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed.

Opposed:

Comments:

17. 936 Pacific Avenue

Application: Heather Mcvcar Ruoss, applicant; Bargeboard LLC, owner; New construction of single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC agreed that, at 5'-0", the elevation of the building was too high and that the building should be raised no higher than the required base flood elevation. The parking space needs to be measured from the front wall of the building, not the front of the porch. Additionally, the porch should have simple posts rather than trimmed-out columns. The proportion of the overhang at the porch needs to be modified to avoid the appearance of a double beam.

John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Elliott Perkins

In favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed.

Opposed:

Comments:

18. 901 Washington Avenue

Application: Construct roofdeck to replace railing installed without a CofA.

Motion: Beth Jacob made a motion to recommend denial of this application. The ARC agreed that a rooftop deck on a one story residential structure would set a bad precedent for the neighborhood.

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed.

In favor: John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Elliott Perkins

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time, there being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.